

Chapter 3

(Part A)

An Argument of Logos: Novels of the Primitive-as-Savior Tradition are Novels of Initiation

3A.1-- Introduction--How do primitive characters gain the respect of readers by guiding heroic characters through the challenges of the American frontier?

This chapter consists of two sections (section A and B) examining the rhetoric of logos, (the appeal of reason) as Cooper, Hawthorne, and Melville implement the technique through their use of primitive-as-savior characters in their respective novels. Through this rhetorical process each novelist creates dramatic tension by having the primitive exhibit unexpected desirable behaviors that prove the primitive's value to the hero, giving readers reason to view the primitive character in a positive light. This first section examines how the primitive-as-savior character qualifies the novels to be termed stories of initiation. The primitive guides the character in the heroic mode and the reader through demanding circumstances, testing the heroic character physically and deepening the heroic character's psychological insight.

3A.2--Initiation in The Deerslayer:

Chingachgook and Hetty both act as primitive saviors providing Natty with what he needs to survive the physical challenges and psychological demands of the frontier. Of these two primitive saviors, Chingachgook's character most directly influences Natty. Having discussed Cooper's rhetorical use of primitivism for arguments of ethos and pathos, it is now necessary to address how Chingachgook qualifies as a primitive savior in his relation with Natty as an argument of logos

(reason). The Deerslayer may be described as a novel of initiation, Chingachgook as a primitive savior, guides Natty (and the reader) through demanding circumstances that test Natty physically and deepen his psychological insight. Ultimately Chingachgook teaches Natty that life is more than the sum of one's intellectual responses, reinforcing Natty's appreciation for the physical as opposed to the intellectual life, his skepticism over social conventions, and developing in Natty a deeper understanding of the significance of his life in relation to others.

Natty's character represents a synthesis of the best traits of White and Native American society. It is revealed in the earlier novels of the series that a hostile tribe killed Natty's family and that the Delawares adopted him as their own. Natty is a brother in the tribe and has performed a ritual that makes him a blood brother with Chingachgook. Moravian missionaries raised Natty among the Delawares and as such he has cultivated the best of primitive and Christian virtues. He is almost piously honest, brave, and skilled at woodlore. He has a love of nature that is the underpinning of a natural morality that has no need of churches or of social institutions. R.W.B. Lewis asserts that "Natty Bumppo is the full-fledged fictional Adam" (Lewis 104). Lewis defines the American Adam as

... an individual emancipated from history, bereft of ancestry ... an individual standing alone, self-reliant and self propelling, ready to confront whatever awaits him with the aid of his own unique and inherent resources. (Lewis 4)

Natty fulfills Lewis's other requirements as an American Adam. He undergoes the ritual trials of an innocent; he is tested in battle and kills his first enemy. He is seen

moving in a complex and largely unfamiliar world of advancing white society and its attractions, most particularly Juddith Hutter, whom Natty treats with consummate honesty and natural dignity. Natty realizes that he is affected by and affects his world. Natty survives all the action and trials of the novel by maintaining an identity that is as "constant, as timeless as nature itself" (Peck 29). Natty finds his moral lessons in the woods (Peck 34). He (Natty) loved the woods for their freshness, their sublime solitudes, their vastness, and their creator.

He seldom moved through them, without pausing to dwell on some peculiar beauty that gave him pleasure, though seldom attempting to investigate the causes; and never did a day pass without his communing in spirit, and this, too, without the aid of forms or language, with the infinite source of all he saw, felt, and beheld. Thus constituted, in a moral sense, and of a steadiness that no danger could appall, or any crisis disturb... . (Cooper, DS 278)

Natty with his tendency for self-reliance and an ability to live in and learn from nature, Deerslayer would seem to have no need of a primitive mentor since he is more primitive than civilized himself, but Chingachgook serves to round out Natty, who because of his "white gifts," escapes being "purely primitive" (Keiser 296).

Chingachgook's character is complementary to Natty. Chingachgook embodies the best traits of the Native American, those of bravery, cunning, a deeply romantic love, self-restraint in time of crisis, affection for friends, and the "red gift" of a love for scalps (Keiser 119). While Chingachgook's primitive gifts have not been tempered by the Moravian missionaries as have Natty's, Chingachgook shows that a lack of Christian training

does not prevent him from exhibiting a pure romantic love for Wah-ta!-Wah or a willingness to die for his bloodbrother. Chingachgook states that he "will be with his friend, Deerslayer; if he be in the land of the spirits, the Great Serpent will crawl at his side; if beneath yonder sun, its warmth and light shall fall on both" (Cooper 434). In one of the final scenes of the novel it is Chingachgook who leaps into the ring of torture to save Natty from the Hurons.

In The Return of the Vanishing American Leslie Fiedler examines the relationship between Natty and Chingachgook and concludes that because Natty is a white man raised and aided by Native Americans, he is "neither a White man, nor a Red, but something new under the sun, the archetypal Westerner whose legend is the essential myth of America" (118). Deerslayer is among the first Americans to be reborn in his encounter with a Native American on the mythic frontier (Fiedler, Return 119).

Hetty's character also plays a vital role in the initiation process. According to critic George Dekker, "Hetty's chief function in The Deerslayer is to expose, by way of contrast, the extreme physical and moral vulnerability of the other characters, who, as they have greater natural gifts and powers to protect themselves, are subject to greater trials and dangers" (Dekker 175). So Hetty who is blessed with an innocent reliance on the moral precepts she was taught as a child, and an intuitive sense of what is good, and what is evil in human conduct, is paired against various characters in The Deerslayer as the novel progresses exposing their moral flaws such as excessive pride and selfishness.

In comparison to the lessons that Natty learns from his

primitive blood brother Chingachgook, R.W.B. Lewis sees Hetty as a flawed model for salvation.

And beneath the comedy of poor Hetty's visit to the Iroquis camp and her attempt to preach the captors into releasing their prisoners is a profoundly suggestive distinction between the quality of Hetty's innocence and that of Hawkeye's (Natty's); Hetty has an innocence which is, ... self delusive helplessness, a half-witted conversation of universal goodness, which exposes her to every physical and moral danger It is partly by the contemplation of that hapless girl, by conversations with Hetty and about her, that Hawkeye arrives at a more durable kind of innocence and at the insight that it must be bounded by an observation of ethical differences. Cooper skillfully exposes the solid core of Hawkeye's Adamism by setting it along the flimsy hopefulness of Hetty Hutter (Lewis 105).

Hetty clearly demonstrates a different form of innocence than that attributed to Natty Bumppo. Natty as the novel's hero fulfills the qualities of the American Adam. Natty is bereft of family history. As an orphan raised by the Delaware tribe, he has grown to be one with the frontier and the natural innocence the frontier embodies in The Leatherstocking Tales. Natty will not be bound by the customs of his society, and he will not be bound to a woman. He politely refuses Judith's proposal of marriage, and he refuses to consent to a deal where in marrying a Huron woman his life would be spared.

For Judith, listening to her sister Hetty brings a momentary realization of her moral failings. Judith's name is overshadowed by rumors that she has been seduced once before by a passing soldier. She hopes that by proposing marriage to Natty her soul will be redeemed.

Talk of your sins, Hetty! If ever there was a creature on earth without sins, it is you! I wish I could say the same of myself; but we shall see. No one knows what changes affection for a good husband can make in a woman's heart. (Cooper, DS 378)

Although Natty admires Judith's resourcefulness and calm mind when facing danger, he will not allow himself to be tied down by

the custom of marriage. Natty is committed to spending his existence as an American Adam, forever living on the edge of society, on an ever-shrinking frontier. There will be no redemption for Judith within Cooper's novel. Dekker explains the inability of Judith to gain salvation as being attributed to the Victorian ethos of the fallen woman, stating that if a woman makes "one false step and [she is] forever expelled from Eden, from Good society, and maybe from heaven..." (Dekkar 182).

Whereas Hetty brings a momentary state of self-consciousness in Judith that she must change her ways for the purpose of salvation, Hetty is also used to expose the hypocrisy latent in the Christian philosophy which she advocates. This hypocrisy is exposed to Hetty when she uses the Bible to argue for the release of Natty.

'This is the Good Book of the pale-faces,' observed one of these chiefs, taking the volume from the unresisting hand of Hetty, who gazed anxiously at his face, while he turned the leaves, as if she expected to witness some visible results from the circumstance. 'This is the law by which my white brethren profess to live?'

...

'It tells him to do good to them that hurt him; and when his brother asks him for his rifle, to give him the powder-horn, too. Such is the pale-face law?'

'Not so -- not so,' answered Hetty earnestly, when these words had been interpreted. 'There is not a word about rifles in the whole book; and powder and bullets give offence to the Great Spirit.'

'Why, then, does the pale-face use them? If he is ordered to give double to him that asks only for one thing, why does he take double from the poor Indians, who ask for no thing? He comes from beyond the rising sun, with his book in his hand, and he teaches the red-man to read it; but why does he forget, himself, all it says? When the Indian gives, he is never satisfied; and now he offers gold for the scalps of our women and children, though he calls us beasts if we take the scalp of a warrior killed in open war. My name is Rivenoak.'

...

When Hetty had got this formidable question ... she did not know what answer to make. 'I know that all I have read from the book is true; and yet it wouldn't seem to be so, would it, by the conduct of those to whom the book was given?'

...

'Stop cry -- no cry,' she said, wiping the tears from the face of Hetty, as she would have performed the same office for a child, and stopping to press her, occasionally, to her own warm bosom with the affection of a sister; 'why you so trouble? You no make he book, if he be wrong; and you no make he pale-face, if he wicked. There wicked red-man, and wicked white man -- no colour all good - no colour all wicked. Chiefs know that well enough.' (Cooper, DS 194-195)

In this passage Hetty is puzzled by the apparent hypocrisy between those who claim to follow the Bible and their actions. The Native-American chiefs address essential issues on the endless greed of the Anglo-American society, and their apparent evil in offering gold for the scalps of women and children. The Native-American woman closes with an important point, that no race is all good, and no race is all wicked. Although this is the same philosophy that Cooper advocates throughout The Deerslayer depicting both noble and ignoble peoples of the white and Native American races, Cooper suggests with his characters that individuals once they have sinned cannot be redeemed.

3A.3--Initiation in Moby Dick:

Having gained their audience's attention by using their primitive characters for shock value, and having gained their audience's good will by presenting a narrative voice that shares in the audience's shock, Cooper, Melville, and Hawthorne proceed in using their primitive characters to add interest and suspense as their respective novel's plots evolve towards climax. This section will demonstrate that primitive characters add interest by being associated with a subject matter that readers find mysterious. This sense of mystery and the exotic surrounding the primitive allows authors to communicate to their audiences through a fresh set of symbols, and to reify old symbols of the

Christian tradition (Baird 19). This exploration of new symbols is especially relevant, if one takes the perspective of Melville scholar James Baird who says that "authentic primitivism is a mode of sentience, a creed springing inevitably from a state of cultural failure" (3). Baird's analysis of primitivism suggests that it is one literary route that writers follow when the past symbols such as those of Christianity are no longer effective for gaining an emotional response from one's audience (Baird 19). Melville, Cooper, and Hawthorne were writing in a critical time in America's history. The mysteries they tap into relate to how Americans see themselves relating with other races and relating with one another. The process of these novelists is along the lines of what John Gardner terms moral fiction. These three works show a truthful reflection, leads readers to reflect on these mysteries in their lives, and pondering the limits and restrictions of the Christian myth through examining the mysterious nature of characters outside the mainstream culture.

Ishmael's curiosity about the nature of Queequeg's character, promotes a similar curiosity within the reader, who has been manipulated to empathize with Ishmael. One significant source for Ishmael's curiosity into the nature of Queequeg's being may be summed with Ishmael's statement as he prepared to sleep with Queequeg for the first time, "Better [to] sleep with a sober cannibal than a drunken Christian (Melville 30)." Again and again Queequeg's pagan spirituality proves more relevant to the benefit of humanity, when viewed side-by-side with Christian traditions. Queequeg's primitive qualities of animism, natural piety, and ritual help Ishmael reflect on the limitations of his Christian spirituality. Queequeg is motivated more by his

internal emotions, than by the rational and written laws of existence (Bell 28).

Ishmael is puzzled by Queequeg's generosity of spirit and cosmic acceptance of fate. Queequeg proves himself to be more thoughtful, and more sensitive to others than many Christian's Ishmael has known. Queequeg is willing to listen to the ideas of others. In chapter 7 "The Chapel" Queequeg is depicted as willing to listen to Christian ideas as Ishmael finds him sitting in the congregation at the Nantucket Whaleman's chapel. Queequeg generously shares his bed with Ishmael in chapter 3 "The Spouter-Inn." For his friendship, Queequeg freely gives Ishmael half his wealth (thirty dollars).

Queequeg proves his natural morality, shown through deeds, to be comparable if not better than that demonstrated by Ishmael's fellow Christians. Twice Queequeg demonstrates his fearlessness, and willingness for self-sacrifice as he jumps into dangerous water to save drowning men. In Chapter 13 "The Wheelbarrow" Queequeg dives into freezing water to save a boy who only minutes earlier had insulted him. On saving the boy Queequeg is cheered as a hero, but displays modesty as if saving the boy was his duty. Queequeg only asks for fresh water to wash off the Brine. None of the Christian men on the ship were willing to risk themselves, jumping into the freezing water to save the boy.

Ishmael contemplates that Queequeg is saying to himself that "It's a mutual, joint-stock world, in all meridians. We cannibals must help these Christians" (Melville 61). On the Pequod in Chapter 80 "The Nut" Queequeg repeats his lifesaving performance by jumping into shark infested waters to save the

African harpooner Tashtego. Again, this scene parallels the Negro boy Pip's being cast into the Ocean during a whale hunt. Stubb (a Christian) does not stop the boat to rescue Pip, assuming that another of the whaleboat's will save him. Stubb's pursuit of profit, results in Pip's going mad as he is forced to spend an extended period in the ocean alone.

Queequeg's origins are another great mystery to readers, especially after being described as a character of great oddity, having a body covered with tattoos, and being first introduced as a peddler of shrunken heads. After their first day together, Queequeg and Ishmael engage in a ritual of the Pacific-Islander's to assert their bond of friendship. Queequeg and Ishmael share a smoke on Queequeg's tomahawk pipe, and at the conclusion of the ritual Queequeg describes himself as married to Ishmael. As they smoke a tomahawk pipe together Queequeg shares his family history with Ishmael. Queequeg is a native of Kokovoko, an island in the South Pacific. Ishmael learns that Queequeg is a prince. His father is king of the island and his uncle is the high priest. Queequeg's royal background serves an important rhetorical purpose in the novel, as it helps readers accept Melville's constant comparisons of Paganism to Christianity, resulting in Paganism being the nobler of the two.

It is easier for readers to accept that a member of the pagan aristocracy behaves better than the average Christian. This comparison gives the skeptical reader an out through which to accept Ishmael's observation of Queequeg's superior morality as an exception rather than the rule. Readers therefore can be more sympathetic to Queequeg's account that he traveled to the West to learn the ways of the Christian world to better his

people, but he learned instead that Christians could be just as evil as pagans.

Ishmael's spiritual union with Queequeg is another point of curiosity for the reader who wonders or is fearful of pagan religions. In chapter 10 "A Bosom Friend" Ishmael presents his argument to the reader for his spiritual union with Queequeg, suggesting that it is necessary under the guiding rules of Christianity that state to do unto others as you would have done to yourself.

I was a good Christian; born and bred in the bosom of the infallible Presbyterian Church. How then could I unite with this wild idolator in worshipping his piece of wood? But what is worship? Thought I. Do you suppose now, Ishmael, that the magnanimous God of heaven and earth--pagans and all included--can possibly be jealous of an insignificant bit of black wood? Impossible! But what is worship?--to do the will of God? that is worship. And what is the will of God?--to do to my fellow man what I would have my fellow man to do to me--that is the will of God. Now, Queequeg is my fellow man. And what do I wish that this Queequeg would do to me? Why, unite with me in my particular Presbyterian form of worship. Consequently, I must then unite with him in his; ergo, I must turn idolator. (Melville 54)

Melville captivates his readers with examples of Queequeg's bravery, nobleness, self-sacrifice. Queequeg's character generates interest and suspense within Melville's novel by continually defying his audiences stereotypical expectations for the pagan. The biggest mystery that Queequeg's character presents to readers, however, is his cosmic acceptance of fate. Queequeg at one point seems content to die. He is deathly sick and has the Pequod's carpenter craft him a coffin built in the shape of a canoe. Queequeg, after lying in the coffin and contemplating, wills himself back to health, explaining only that he had some business to take care of on land that he had forgotten about. This casual acceptance of death is an enigma

for the Christian mindset, yet for the primitive who is depicted as more focused on the spiritual and emotional realms, than the physical and logical mindset of the West, death is merely part of the natural cycle and not to be feared.

3A.4-- The hero's/heroine's initiation in The Scarlet Letter and The Blithedale Romance:

In both The Scarlet Letter and The Blithedale Romance Hawthorne frames each novel's story line around the development of a female character in the primitive mode, and how this primitive character initiates a character in the heroic mode as he or she faces the physical and psychological challenges of entering a new frontier. In The Scarlet Letter, Pearl acts as a primitive-as-savior character, to her mother Hester. In The Blithedale Romance Priscilla acts as a primitive-as-savior figure to the novel's narrator, Miles Coverdale. Pearl and Priscilla in their respective novels qualify as leading the initiation of a heroic character because they fulfill the following criteria.

First in each novel, the arrival of the primitive savior, marks a life altering change in the heroic character's life, and change from which he or she cannot return to the consciousness he or she possessed prior to the primitive character's introduction. Second, the primitive character through word or deed models behaviors and poses problems for the heroic character to overcome. Through observing the behaviors and solving the problems posed by the primitive, the heroic character has the opportunity to learn and prosper. Third after initiating the hero, the primitive character is socially redeemed. In the case of Hawthorne's novels this occurs through the primitives receiving an inheritance to which they were secretly entitled,

and through the primitive's marrying someone of high social status. By fulfilling these criteria of changing the hero's life, of teaching and testing the hero, and of being socially redeemed, Hawthorne presents his readers with an argument of reason, persuading readers to accept and admire Pearl and Priscilla as primitive savior figures.

In The Scarlet Letter, Pearl's arrival marks a point of no return in Hester's life. Pearl by her very existence, forces the physical and social marginalization of Hester from the colony of Boston. Although Hawthorne first introduces Hester to readers at a point immediately after she gives birth to Pearl, Hawthorne does provide the reader with background information revealing Hester's past. Through Hawthorne's narration, readers learn that Hester was once part of her society's upper class. She was raised in England, by wealthy parents of declining fortune. Hoping to make a good life for their daughter, her parents arranged for their daughter to marry the wealthy Dr. Chillingworth who lived in Germany. When Hester first arrived in Boston, she occupied a high social position. The members of the Boston colony identified Hester as the wife, of a wealthy and respected scholar.

When Hester arrived in Boston, it was the first time in her life where she found herself without the guidance of her parents, or instruction of her husband. Presumably, when her husband's ship failed to arrive, and was assumed lost, Hester found herself in need of an authority figure's guidance. Not having her parent, relative, or husband in the New World, Hester presumably turns to her spiritual leader, the reverend Dimmesdale for guidance, and emotional support. This relationship of Dimmesdale

and Hester results in Pearl's conception.

Pearl's arrival causes Hester to lose her social status. When her community discovers Hester's pregnancy, Hester's social status goes from that of being a respected member of the upper class, to being an ostracized criminal. The community imprisons Hester during her pregnancy. After giving birth to Pearl, Hester's community subjects her to the public shame of standing on a scaffold with her newly born daughter and being declared an adulteress. Women of the Boston colony berate her, suggesting that the punishment of wearing a scarlet letter "A" is too lenient. Some suggest that branding or hanging would be a more suitable punishment.

'Goodwives,' said a hard-featured dame of fifty, 'I'll tell ye a piece of my mind. It would be greatly for the public behoof, if we women, being of mature age and church-members in good repute, should have the handling of such malefactresses as this Hester Prynne. What think ye, gossips? If the hussy stood up for judgment before us five, that are now here in a knot together, would she come off with such a sentence as the worshipful magistrates have awarded? Marry, I trow not!'

...

'At the very least, they should have put the brand of a hot iron on Hester Prynne's forehead. Madame Hester would have winced at that, I warrant me. But she,--the naughty baggage,--little will she care what they put upon the bodice of her gown!'

'What do we talk of marks and brands, whether on the bodice of her gown, or the flesh of her forehead?' cried another female, the ugliest as well as the most pitiless of these self-constituted judges. 'This woman has brought shame upon us all, and ought to die. Is there no law for it?' (Hawthorne, SL 37-38)

The suffering of this public shame and ostracism because of Pearl's birth is part of Hester's initiation into a new life. After suffering the shame placed upon her by the Boston colonists, Hester moves from the social isolation of the prison where she lived during the late months of her pregnancy to live in further social isolation in a small cottage at the edge of the Boston colony.

In The Blithedale Romance Priscilla's arrival at the Blithedale community marks a point of no return in Coverdale's life. Coverdale at the novel's conclusion reveals that he is forever traumatized by his inability to master Priscilla's lessons of modesty, selflessness, and vitality. The novel's reader may not realize Priscilla's importance to Coverdale until reaching the novel's final sentence where Coverdale declares, "I-I myself-was in love-with-Priscilla!" (228) Coverdale waits until the last sentence to reveal his secret love for Priscilla. By having Coverdale's narration conclude with a declaration of his secret love for Priscilla-the narration leaves the reader with the impression that this moment where Coverdale declares his love for Priscilla, is Coverdale's reason for telling the reader of his experiences at the Blithedale Commune.

Hawthorne designs Coverdale's narration from the first chapter until the last chapter to focus on the mystery of Priscilla. In the first chapter entitled "Old Moodie," Old Moodie (Priscilla's father) approaches Coverdale outside his Bachelor apartment, and after making much mystery over needing a great favor of Coverdale, Old Moodie suddenly changes his mind and hurries off without requesting anything. Reader's later learn that Old Moodie was looking for someone to escort Priscilla to the Blithedale community, and in reflecting on Coverdale's character, he decided to ask Hollingsworth to escort his daughter. Coverdale who joins the Blithedale community with hopes of living a more creative and fulfilling life, will on meeting Priscilla, spend much of his time at the Blithedale community, attempting to discover the mystery of Priscilla's past.

In The Scarlet Letter, Pearl's character through word and deed models behaviors and poses problems for Hester to overcome. When Hester is forced to live in isolation on the outskirts of Boston, Pearl acts as a companion to her mother. Taking care of Pearl gives Hester a reason to live, and keeps her from suffering a mental breakdown similar to the one Melville's character Pip suffered when left alone in the vastness of the ocean (Bell, Hawthorne 126). Hester fears for her soul and that of her daughter. She feels that her adultery has made her the brood of Cain.

In all her intercourse with society, however, there was nothing that made her feel as if she belonged to it. Every gesture, every word, and even every silence of those with whom she came in contact, implied, and often expressed, that she was banished, and as much alone as if she inhabited another sphere or communicated with the common nature by other organs and senses than the rest of human kind (Hawthorne SL, 59).

Hester's isolation is a deep and bitter one. Hester's social ostracism impacts Pearl. She spends more time, with Pearl than other mothers, not having the social demands that are placed on normal mothers. Hester is in constant communication with Pearl. This constant communication results in the "strange rapidity" with which Pearl arrived "at an age that was capable of social intercourse beyond the mother's ever ready smile and nonsense-words!" (Hawthorne SL 65).

Pearl guides Hester to live a selfless and moral life. After her ostracism, Pearl is the only companion that Hester has for emotional support. When Pearl encounters other children, she is taunted by them, and these encounters result in Pearl responding with violent outbursts and attacks, such as yelling and rock throwing. Pearl's asocial behavior worries her mother who fears that Pearl will inherit her moral failings, as many

members of the Boston colony expect.

Hester's embroidered "A" is an important symbol for Pearl. Pearl uses references to the "A" to manipulate her mother's behavior. Hawthorne tells us that it is the "A" and not Hester's smile that was the first feature Pearl came to know of her mother.

The very first thing which she noticed in her life was ... the scarlet letter on Hester's bosom! ... One day, as her mother stood over the cradle, the infant's eyes had been caught by the glimmering of the gold embroidery about the letter; and putting up her little hand, she grasped at it, smiling, not doubtfully, but with a decided gleam that gave her face the look of a much older child. Then, gasping for breath, did Hester Prynne clutch the fatal token. Instinctively endeavoring to tear it away; so infinite was the torture inflicted by the intelligent touch of Pearl's baby-hand. (Hawthorne, SL 67)

From an early age Pearl learned she could communicate with her mother and bring about an emotional response through an emphasis on the "A" (Proser 18). In chapter five Pearl admits to her mother that she did not know the meaning of the "A" or of Dimmesdale's placing his hand and over his heart, but she sensed a relationship of the two.

Pearl also helps Hester build a bond with Dimmesdale. Pearl causes Dimmesdale to feel a sense of guilt and responsibility for Pearl and Hester's ostracism. This can be observed in one scene, for example, when Pearl is seven, and Dimmesdale and Hester meet to talk in the woods. During this conversation Hester takes off her "A" for the first time. During this moment Pearl plays happily in the forest. When Hester calls Pearl, Pearl refuses to come to Hester and throws a tantrum. She will not come to Hester until she puts back on her "A" and puts her hair back up in her conservative cap. Pearl is traumatized because the one constant thing in her life, her mother's physical appearance has changed.

This is one of many events triggered by Pearl that reminded Dimmesdale of the hypocrisy of his ministry. Pearl helps Hester survive in the frontier by reuniting Hester with her lover, Dimmesdale, and by prompting Dimmesdale to accept his responsibility as Pearl's father, as well as by prompting Dimmesdale's confession—an act which assures his salvation (Proper 21).

Priscilla's character through word and deed models behaviors and poses challenges that initiate Coverdale into the frontier of the Blithedale colony. Coverdale ventures to the Blithedale community to escape the dark influences of the city such as poverty, pollution, and crime, and to become more connected with nature in order to improve his poetry. Priscilla's character represents many of the virtues that Coverdale lacks, virtues that would make his life fulfilling and improve his poetry. Priscilla embodies the qualities of selflessness, vitality, and passion that Coverdale lacks. Coverdale's character is deeply analytical. He prefers to analyze and observe life rather than directly participating in it. Priscilla's character gives Coverdale a mystery to solve, and a sense of purpose.

Coverdale is fascinated with Priscilla's character. Much of Coverdale's dialogue, revolves around the mystery of Priscilla. Coverdale wants to know about Priscilla's origins. Coverdale seeks to probe into Priscilla's life before moving to the Blithedale colony, rather than accepting Priscilla without reservation. Coverdale is a voyeur. Zenobia frequently catches Coverdale watching her. At one point Zenobia confronts Coverdale on his spying. Coverdale asserts that it is his duty to discover the secret of Zenobia's relationship with Priscilla. This

prompts Zenobia to scream at Coverdale:

'Oh, this stale excuse of duty!' said Zenobia, in a whisper so full of scorn that it penetrated me like the hiss of a serpent. 'I have often heard it before, from those who sought to interfere with me, and I know precisely what it signifies. Bigotry; self-conceit; an insolent curiosity; a meddling temper; a cold-blooded criticism, founded on a shallow interpretation of half-perceptions; a monstrous scepticism in regard to any conscience or any wisdom, except one's own; a most irreverent propensity to thrust Providence aside, and substitute one's self in its awful place--out of these, and other motives as miserable as these, comes your idea of duty! But beware, sir! With all your fancied acuteness, you step blindfold into these affairs. For any mischief that may follow your interference, I hold you responsible!' (Hawthorne, BR 157)

While Zenobia threatens to hold Coverdale responsible for any bad outcome that results from his interference, Coverdale with his detached relationship with the world, cannot recognize that his actions may have consequences.

Coverdale's habit of living voyeuristically through the observation of others, physically and emotionally isolates him from humanity. Coverdale does not realize that his actions or inaction has consequences for those in the world around him. Even though Coverdale is a founding member of the Blithedale community, he views himself as not an equal, but rather as an outside observer. He prefers to watch the activities of Zenobia, Hollingsworth, and Priscilla, rather than directly participating with them.

In the midst of cheerful society, I had often a feeling of loneliness. For it was impossible not to be sensible, that, while these three characters figured so largely on my private theatre, I--though probably reckoned as a friend by all--was at best but a secondary or tertiary personage with either of them. (Hawthorne, BR 65)

In contemplating his relationship with the world, Coverdale considers himself to play the role of a classic chorus. He believes that his life is controlled by destiny rather than by his decisions.

My own part, in these transactions, was singularly subordinate. It resembled that of the Chorus in a classic play, which seems to be set aloof from the possibility of personal concernment, and bestows the whole measure of its hope or fear, its exultation or sorrow, on the fortunes of others, between whom and itself this sympathy is the only bond. Destiny, it may be--the most skilful of stage-managers--seldom chooses to arrange its scenes, and carry forward its drama, without securing the presence of at least one calm observer. (Hawthorne, BR 91)

Priscilla gives Coverdale's life purpose while he is at the Blithedale community. Coverdale imagines himself the hero who will save Priscilla from her mysterious perils. He is jealous of Hollingsworth who he feels has a harmful influence on both Priscilla and Zenobia. Coverdale even imagines that he will save Priscilla.

When a young girl comes within the sphere of such a man, she is as perilously situated as the maiden whom, in the old classical myths, the people used to expose to a dragon. If I had any duty whatever, in reference to Hollingsworth, it was, to endeavor to save Priscilla from that kind of personal worship which her sex is generally prone to lavish upon saints and heroes. It often requires but one smile, out of the hero's eyes into the girl's or woman's heart, to transform this devotion, from a sentiment of the highest approval and confidence, into passionate love. Now, Hollingsworth smiled much upon Priscilla; more than upon any other person. If she thought him beautiful, it was no wonder.

...

There was the more danger of this, inasmuch as the footing, on which we all associated at Blithedale, was widely different from that of conventional society. While inclining us to the soft affections of the Golden Age, it seemed to authorize any individual, of either sex, to fall in love with any other, regardless of what would elsewhere be judged suitable and prudent.

Had I been as cold-hearted as I sometimes thought myself, nothing would have interested me more than to witness the play of passions that must thus have been evolved. But, in honest truth, I would really have gone far to save Priscilla, at least, from the catastrophe in which such a drama would be apt to terminate. (Hawthorne, BR 66-67)

Priscilla represents for Coverdale an ideal object of his love. Priscilla embodies the qualities of selflessness, vitality, and the love that Coverdale lacks. Because Coverdale cannot actively participate in his life, he cannot be a suitor of Priscilla. After the novel's climax Coverdale continues his "poor individual life, which was not attenuated of most of its proper substance" (Hawthorne, BR 146). As much as Coverdale would like to forget his memory of Priscilla and his personal failure of not declaring his love for her, Priscilla's memory continues to haunt him. When Coverdale addresses readers in the novel's final chapter, twelve years after his experience at Blithedale, it is evident that his inability to gain Priscilla's love has had a catatonic effect on his life.

The redemption of the primitive savior is another important element of the hero's initiation. In Hawthorne's novels the redemption of the primitive signifies the separation of hero and primitive. Joseph Campbell in The Hero with a Thousand Faces identifies this separation of the heroic character from his or her primitive teacher as an archetypal stage of the hero's adventure (Campbell, Hero 77). It is during this phase when the hero is separated from his or her primitive companion, that the hero can be tested. Readers learn if the hero has mastered the primitive's lessons (Campbell, Hero 97). While in Cooper and Melville's works the primitives are separated from the hero (Queequeg dies on the Pequod, and Chingachgook goes off into the

woods for ten years with his son) in Hawthorne's novels where the qualities of primitivism are embodied in white female characters a different type of separation is required.

By depicting Pearl and Priscilla as both inheriting great fortunes and marrying members of the upper class, Hawthorne redeems these primitive-as-savior characters in the eyes of their respective communities, and in the eyes of readers. This redemption of his primitive-as-savior characters Pearl and Priscilla validates the truth of their teachings, and validates what the hero has learned. In Hawthorne's fictional world, as in popular belief, moral status is equated with social status. The primitive-as-savior characters unexpected change of social status adds a sophisticated element of irony to each novel, as the lowest and most morally suspect member of society is proven the most moral, and most knowledgeable.

At the end of The Scarlet Letter Pearl's character is socially redeemed. Pearl who at the novel's initiation was morally suspect as the child of an adulterous affair, has a reversal of fortune. She inherits the vast estate of Hester's estranged husband Chillingworth.

At old Roger Chillingworth's decease (which took place within the year), and by his last will and testament, of which Governor Bellingham and the Reverend Mr. Wilson were executors, he bequeathed a very considerable amount of property, both here and in England, to little Pearl, the daughter of Hester Prynne. ...

So Pearl--the elf-child,--the demon offspring, as some people, up to that epoch, persisted in considering her-- became the richest heiress of her day, in the New World. (Hawthorne, SL 176)

Pearl, with her new wealth leaves Boston to live in England. The reader learns that Hester is crafting baby clothes for Pearl's child, and it is rumored that she married a man of noble blood, as Hester receives letters from Pearl with bearing the seal or

"heraldry" of a noble family. Pearl as an embodiment of primitivism has served Hester, providing Hester with the challenge of raising a wild child, who under the myths of Christian sin should have followed in the sinful footsteps of her mother.

Pearl's primitivism provided Hester with the initiative to take charge of her future, rather than accepting her society's bleak expectations for her salvation or that of her child. Pearl brings about in Hester, the stereotypically masculine quality of assertiveness that her personality contained after being separated from her father and husband in the New World, and the virtue of selflessness in her willingness to protect Pearl from the lurid predictions and plans the community of Boston held for Pearl. Pearl's financial and marital success validates for reader's that Hester has earned her salvation.

At the end of The Blithedale Romance Priscilla's character is socially redeemed. Priscilla is revealed as Zenobia's half sister and inherits on Zenobia's death the vast estate to which Zenobia was an heiress. Priscilla also wins the love of Hollingsworth, the wealthy philanthropist. In the novel's last chapter it is revealed that Priscilla and Hollingsworth have married. Priscilla's reversal of fortune reassures readers of the moral validity of the behavior's Priscilla modeled. Priscilla, whom Coverdale suspected of having a scandalous past, is proved virtuous. Coverdale observed Priscilla as full of life, despite her poverty, and lack of education. Priscilla who initially appeared in the novel as a frail and weak figure in the environment of the countryside transforms into a character full of vitality. Coverdale envisions Priscilla at one point as a

squirrel ready to run up a tree. Priscilla is proven selfless. She is willing to work tirelessly on the chores required for the Blithedale community. She is willing to turn herself over to the dark mesmerist, Westervelt, at the bidding of her sister. Priscilla demonstrates the capacity for great love, clinging to her sister's side even when her affections are rebuffed.

When Coverdale leaves the Blithedale community a week after the death of Zenobia, he has been deeply touched by the qualities of vitality, selflessness, and love he has witnessed in Priscilla. Whereas Priscilla blossomed when she was taken out of the environment of the city, Coverdale proves equally unsuccessful in both country and city. The novel's final chapter, set approximately a decade after Coverdale left the Blithedale community, reveals Coverdale's failure. Coverdale who spent his days voyeuristically observing Hollingswoth, Zenobia, and Priscilla, has given up writing poetry. He spends his days presumably just as he did at the novel's initial chapter, sitting in his bachelor apartment, smoking and drinking alone. While Coverdale unknowingly struggles with his inability to incorporate Priscilla's virtues into his own empty life, in telling his tale of Priscilla, the lost love he never had, Coverdale succeeds in validating Priscilla's character to readers as a virtuous character of the primitive-as-savior tradition.

(Part B)

**Another Argument of Logos:
The Primitive Savior Teaches Life Lessons**

3B.1--Introduction: Primitive characters demonstrate their worth by teaching valuable life lessons to a hero and the hero's community.

Another rhetorical appeal of reason that creates dramatic tension in each novel stems from each author's representation of the primitive-as-savior character as a teacher of meaningful life lessons. The primitive character teaches that life is more than the sum of one's intellectual responses, fostering in the heroic character an appreciation for the physical as opposed to the intellectual life. The primitive develops in the heroic character a healthy skepticism about the value of social conventions, and a more heightened understanding of one's own life in relation to others (Baird 244). Through teaching life lessons the primitive-as-savior characters are shown as figures of social value. This chapter examines Hawthorne's use of primitive characters to teach life lessons in The Scarlet Letter and The Blithedale Romance. For additional analysis of how primitive characters are used to teach life lessons in the writings of Melville and Cooper refer to Appendix 3.

3B.2--Life Lessons in The Scarlet Letter:

Pearl as a primitive savior teaches valuable life lessons to the heroine of The Scarlet Letter her mother Hester. These lessons are part of Hawthorne's rhetoric of logos, showing the reader reasons why Pearl's character is of social value. Pearl's character gives Hester the opportunity to experience romantic (true) love. Pearl's arrival forces Hester to take responsibility for her actions. Pearl fosters in Hester

selflessness, and a sense of social responsibility.

Dimmesdale during one of his secret meetings with Hester asserts that crimes committed out of feelings of anger, are far worse than arising from the emotion of love.

We are not, Hester, the worst sinners in the world. There is one worse than even the polluted priest! The old man's revenge has been blacker than my sin. He has violated, in cold blood, the sanctity of the human heart. Thou and I, Hester, never did so. (Hawthorne, SL 133)

According to Dimmesdale violating the sanctity of the human heart, is a crime far worse than violating other doctrines of Christianity. Before her relationship with Dimmesdale, Hester had never truly experienced the emotion of romantic love. Pearl's birth fostered this relationship. Hester proves her commitment to Dimmesdale by keeping his identity a secret. Pearl's instinctive recognition of her father, also helps strengthen Dimmesdale's love of both Hester and his daughter. Pearl helps Dimmesdale develop a love for Pearl that is strong enough where he will conceive running away with Hester and Pearl- A passion so strong that Dimmesdale will be willing to confess his fatherhood to all of Boston.

Pearl's existence also provides Hester the opportunity feel a selfless love for her daughter. In describing Hester's relationship with Pearl, critic Hugo McPherson suggests that the emotions associated with motherhood, push Hester closer towards understanding the truth of human nature than those blinded by the "stern legality of 'the righteous Colony of ... Massachusetts, where iniquity is dragged out into the sunshine (McPherson 186, [Hawthorne, SL 40 qtd. by McPherson]). Hester feels absolute responsibility of Pearl's wellbeing. She is willing to do anything necessary to guarantee Pearl's wellbeing. When members

of the Boston colony suggest that Pearl would be better off being raised by someone other than Hester, Hester takes her argument for the guardianship of Pearl right to the colony's governor. While she is able to retain the custody of Pearl only with the intervention of Dimmesdale, Hester is a dutiful parent, always fearing that signs of her fallen nature as an adulteress will surface in Pearl.

Pearl brings about actions of selflessness in Hester. Hester being concerned about her daughter's spiritual wellbeing commits herself to selfless acts of charity. Hester knits cloths for babies of the poor, and stands vigil at the deathbeds of the dying. As Hester approaches her final years, and knowledge of her adultery is no longer common knowledge, Hester continues to wear her scarlet letter "A" out of repentance. Her former badge of shame is recognized as meaning angel rather than adultery. In her final years, Hester is remembered for her selfless deeds rather than her former indiscretions.

Hester Prynne had no selfish ends, nor lived in any measure for her own profit and enjoyment, people brought all their sorrows and perplexities, and besought her counsel, as one who had herself gone through a mighty trouble. Women, more especially,--in the continually recurring trials of wounded, wasted, wronged, misplaced, or erring and sinful passion,--or with the dreary burden of a heart unyielded, because unvalued and unsought,--came to Hester's cottage, demanding why they were so wretched, and what the remedy! Hester comforted and counselled them, as best she might. She assured them, too, of her firm belief, that, at some brighter period, when the world should have grown ripe for it, in Heaven's own time, a new truth would be revealed, in order to establish the whole relation between man and woman on a surer ground of mutual happiness. Earlier in life, Hester had vainly imagined that she herself might be the destined prophetess, but had long since recognized the impossibility that any mission of divine and mysterious truth should be confided to a woman stained with sin, bowed down with shame, or even burdened with a life-long sorrow. The angel and apostle of the coming revelation must be a woman, indeed, but lofty, pure, and beautiful; and wise, moreover, not through dusky grief, but the ethereal medium of joy; and

showing how sacred love should make us happy, by the truest test of a life successful to such an end!
(Hawthorne, SL 177)

Hester also lives to see her daughter who was raised as an ostracized member of society have a reversal of fortunes inheriting Chilligsworth's vast estate—and moving to Hester's homeland to become one of England's wealthiest women.

By enabling Hester to experience love, to appreciate that her actions have consequences on others, and to develop a spirit of generosity and selflessness Pearl helped her mother learn valuable life lessons.

3B.3--Life Lessons taught by Priscilla in The Blithedale Romance:

Priscilla as a primitive savior teaches valuable life lessons, lessons which the novel's heroic narrator, Miles Coverdale, and the other members of The Blithedale Community, Zenobia and Hollingsworth fail to realize. Although Priscilla's lessons are not appreciated by Coverdale or the Blithedale community's other members, Priscilla's teachings reveal Hawthorne's rhetoric of logos, proving Priscilla's character to be of social value, and of great consequence to the life of narrator Miles Coverdale.

In the final sentence of The Blithedale Romance, Coverdale declares that he was in love with Priscilla. Priscilla, although the lowliest member of the Blithedale community socially, has had a profound influence on Coverdale's life. Priscilla as a primitive was Coverdale's opposite. She was a skilled seamstress, and quite eager to engage in physical work. Coverdale declared himself an intellectual, making his name as a minor poet, and detesting the farm work expected of him at

Blithedale. Coverdale preferred to experience life second hand. Often he preferred to watch the doings of Hollingsworth, Zenobia, and Priscilla, that engaging them directly in conversation, or by participating in their activities. Coverdale is a voyeur, at times making Zenobia uncomfortable with his spying. Unlike Coverdale, Priscilla's approach to relationships was direct, emotionally involved one, at times physically clinging to the side of her sister, and eventually winning the heart of Hollingsworth. At the novel's conclusion Coverdale admits that he has stopped writing poetry, and that little else has changed in his life since his experience at the Blithedale colony. Coverdale traveled to the Blithedale colony with the hopes of finding influences there that would improve his poetry. He hoped the experience would make him more aware of nature. Priscilla represents the ability to engage life first hand that Coverdale lacked. Coverdale spends his time imagining the mysteries of Priscilla's past rather than forming a direct relationship with her. Coverdale is too blinded by the social stigma of Priscilla's poverty to see Priscilla as an equal. As a result he fails to understand the life force that Priscilla's character embodies. His passion for Priscilla is the secret the narrative voice of Coverdale feels obligated to reveal to readers at the last possible minute, but his revelation falls flat. While bitter over Hollingsworth's marriage to Priscilla, Coverdale never consciously appreciates why his inability to form a relationship with Priscilla is so tormenting to him. Priscilla embodied the life force, the selfless love, and physical passion for living that Coverdale lacked.

At the novel's conclusion Coverdale reveals himself as self-

centered and egotistical. He takes pride in tormenting Hollingsworth over the failure of his plan to form a socialist community for reforming the world's criminals. Whereas Hollingsworth recognizes the failures of his personality, and feels personally responsible for Zenobia's suicide, Coverdale feels no sense of responsibility to the failure of the Blithedale community and does not realize that his actions have consequences. At the end of the novel, Coverdale proves himself little better than Zenobia who killed herself when she lost her fortune, and the love of Hollingsworth to her sister Priscilla. As Zenobia chose to end her life, rather than face a change of social status, or to accept her sister as an equal, Coverdale by not living life fully, by observing rather than participating, and by refusing to accept Priscilla as an equal has sentenced himself to a life of physical and intellectual stagnation. Had Coverdale, or the other members of the Blithedale community appreciated Priscilla's selflessness, or vitality for life, the members of the Blithedale community may have succeeded in their socialist quest, rather than allowing the community to be crushed by the forces of ego, greed, and lust.